

INTRODUCTION

The branch of learning aimed at increasing opportunities for work, sustainable livelihoods, socio-economic development and personal empowerment in knowledge economies refers to Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET). Technical and Vocational Education and Training is only tool to acquaint the individuals with the skills to meet demands of today's society warranting them to have knowledge, practical and social skills and above all ability to adapt and correspond to the ever changing work environments.

Skills development sector in Pakistan historically have been neglected and incapable of meeting the set targets and in upgradation of skills in Pakistan as per local and international market demands. Pakistan is having population of 184 million, out of which 60 % is under 30 years of age, and the median age is 22 years¹. The estimated statistics suggest that the working age population will double over the next 35 years. Low productivity, inadequate training, poor and outdated modes of imparting TVET relative to international standards and requirements are the main characteristics of the TVET sector of Pakistan. Pakistan has given attention to TVET since its inception, but the major complaints have been regarding the irrelevance of training imparted, Ineffective policies and governance. Pakistan needs to streamline TVET structure to produce skilful employable workforce, capable of competing in the international labour market and local industry.

Problem Statement

At present, the TVET sector in Pakistan is suffering both in organization of the sector and the organizational apparatus governing the sector. The TVET sector has neither been acknowledged as a stream of education due the lack of political will, a proper TVET policy, resources, modes of

¹Bureau of Statistics, population survey report 2014. Government of Pakistan

imparting TVET nor the organizational apparatus governing the TVET has capacity to reform due to duplications and conflicts among different authorities established to regulate the TVET. Different authorities have been established both at National and Provincial levels to equip major chunk of workable population with skills and lifelong learning but those have not performed as expected and resultantly Pakistan is lagging behind. The underperformance can be attributed to conflicting and overlapping provisions among federal and provincial authorities regarding their functions and duties. This has led to the confusion among different authorities and chain of command in streamlining the TVET sector in Pakistan. Furthermore, the 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan has devolved the subject of education to provinces, leaving only standards in TVET in the federal competence. This has led to more confusion and affecting the governance many fold, as provincial authorities have started to make policies of their own without taking into account federal standards. Some federal level authorities have overlapping functions for which they are not mandated. The situation has worsened in the backdrop of the fact that neither at national nor provincial level efforts have been made to reconcile and make a comprehensive/compatible legislation to eliminate and overcome the overlapping and conflicting provisions to ensure proper governance. There are various authorities functioning at federal level with either overlapping functions or those which are not mandated.

Review of Literature

TVET has been the area on which a lot of research has been conducted worldwide and the countries having very strong organization of TVET sector and a coherent and unified organizational apparatus governing it, have discussed it in more details by analyzing all dimensions of the sector, however, very little work has been done in Pakistani context. Though few research papers including World Bank, ILO, GIZ and even few education polices have discussed the issues and factor affecting TVET sector in Pakistan both in organizational

perspective and management of the TVET, yet no viable solutions have been presented except to recommend that TVET sector is required to be reformed in organization and apparatus governing the TVET organization. The TVET Reforms Program (TRSP) presently being implemented has also identified Governance Reforms as the first and foremost component yet no progress has been made to overcome and remove anomalies, duplications and conflicts of TVET authorities to make it a coherent, unified and capable to meet new emerging challenges of labour market. The growth and constantly changing TVET sector worldwide means that only such a TVET sector can compete and grow having built-in flexibility to cater for these growth and changes to ensure employment-intensive growth strategy. The growth and emergence of new labour demands have led to address two problems virtually everywhere: the first is to explore ways to make a training system flexible enough and possessing wide coverage and the second is to arrange for and provision of adequate funds and resources to establish and sustain a training system of this type.

Significance of the Study

Although studies have been conducted on TVET sector in Pakistan but still a study in the organizational structure of Pakistan have not been conducted with reference to its impact on present state of TVET in Pakistan. The study intends to make a comprehensive analysis of fragmented governance, conflicting and overlapping provisions in applicable laws regulating the TVET. This is an inclusive study conducted to draw insight from the past, enquire about the contemporary approaches both at national and international fronts and suggests a way forward for policy formation with the aim to improve TVET sector in Pakistan having capacity to incorporate the youth bulge in productive economy in coming years having potential to overturn the fortune of Pakistan. The study will help future researchers, policy makers and public policy students in formation of appropriate policy making to address the problems of fragmented governance, conflicting and overlapping provisions in laws regulating the TVET and analytical study regarding TVET and organizational structures in Pakistan.

Research Methodology

This study is primarily a descriptive and highlights the issue of fragmented governance, conflicting and overlapping provisions in laws concerning TVET organisations.

A Qualitative research approach is applied in this study which makes use of secondary as well as primary data. The Laws governing TVET sector in Pakistan have been studied and compared to find out the anomalies, duplications and conflicts among the TVET bodies serving at Federal and provincial levels. There have been reports on the establishment of working of such bodies, which have been utilized in analysing the performance.

For the employment of primary sources, discussions and interviews have been conducted to get better understanding of the issue and opinion formation. Applicable laws, composition and mandate of TVET authorities, agreements with NGOs in provision of TVET and official documents have been consulted as well. In addition, secondary sources such as journals, books, newspapers and online available data in interface with industry's requirements have also been consulted during the research work.

STRUCTURE, DUPLICATIONS AND CONFLICTS BETWEEN FEDERAL AND PROVINCIAL AUTHORITIES

The Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973 gives Federal Government a responsibility to, “promote, with special care, the educational and economic interests of backward classes or areas and make technical and professional education generally available on merit. Federal agencies and institutes for the purpose having the role to promote special studies and professional and technical training have been established in compliance of warrants of Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan.

Similarly, the provincial technical and vocational authorities (TVETAs) have been established to provide technical and vocational education in pursuance of national direction and policy thereof. The constitution and establishment of provincial authorities under the respective legislation manifest conflicting and overlapping provisions regarding functions of such authorities and authorities established under the federal laws and hence deny a coherent and uniformed TVET sector of Pakistan having capacity to overturn its fortunes.

The conflicting and overlapping functions of federal and provincial TVET authorities need to be seen and analyzed on the touch stone of 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan as the Amendment has changed the respective constitutional mandate of Federating units, and provinces have been obligated for provision of education in country.

Pre 18th Amendment Scenario, in this scenario the subject was vesting with Federal Government, therefore organizational apparatus was required to be such in which federal authorities would have supremacy of laws and functions/directions assigned and issued by the federal authorities had overriding effect on the provincial laws so far as falling in conflict with the federal laws but at the first instance to have complete organizational harmony such laws and organizational apparatus was required to be placed in such a way that no such conflict arise to give and express the clear intention and sincerity towards the revamping TVET sector of Pakistan. However, as TVET has never been priority of any government in Pakistan, hence it fails on the first such touchstone as the federal and provincial authorities had conflicting statutory provisions and functions thereof and resultantly both lock horn on any such issue of conflict on the grounds that laws governing the authority has bestowed such function to the authority which destroyed the whole fabric of TVET sector in Pakistan. The functions of federal and provincial authorities in most of the cases are in direct conflict with each other, denying the uniformed and coherent organizational apparatus under which national TVET policies and

guidelines are followed in letter and spirit by each province. The organizational disharmony and conflict did nothing but to deprive the TVET sector of Pakistan to emerge as vibrant sector to make the youth of Pakistan contributing immensely in GDP.

In Post 18th Amendment Scenario, the subject of education has been devolved to provinces and now the provinces are fully responsible to have their own vocational educational setup. The certain statutory functions of the federal TVET authorities assigned before 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan are in contravention of the spirit of Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan hence needs to be realigned to render organization harmony and to remove fragmented governance.

Though, the subject of education have devolved to the provinces after 18th amendment yet the standards in technical education is a federal subject under entry number 29 to the federal legislative list, furthermore the Supreme Court of Pakistan has also declared that there needs to be national direction for technical and vocational education in the country ².

There is a dire need to reform fragmented and conflicting/duplicated TVET sector of Pakistan in letter and spirit. TVET should be a priority of the State, it will not only help to improve the employment rate and standards of living of the poor but can be instrumental in countering terrorism. Most school dropout are from far flung, remote and backward areas, if government can make technical education and training available to these areas it will channelize the potential of our youngsters and if it is ignored there is a possibility that they might fall prey to the terrorists' schemes.

Before making comparison/analysis of functions of federal and provincial authorities, it is appropriate to discuss role and responsibilities of Federal Ministry of Education Training and

² Supreme Court Judgment

Standards to understand the role of Federal Government in TVET sector. The subject of education and Technical training has been dealt by different authorities in Pakistan.

Ministry of Education, Training and Standards in Higher Education has got an extra share to concentrate on education and TVET sector after 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan as federal government also have a huge responsibility to ensure that the basic quality and TVET education and trainings are accessible to all citizens of Pakistan and that every person has access to them and have equal opportunities to enroll themselves. At national level, the Ministry of Education, Training and Standards in Higher Education is responsible for general policy planning and coordination. Its vision is to make “Pakistan a developed and prosperous country by attaining full potential of its citizens, through demand driven training.”

The Ministry has the function to develop policy planning and coordination for ensuring integrated professional, vocational and technical training in line with international standards and to develop a dynamic professional, vocational and technical training system to ensure horizontal and vertical linkages. It also has to make proposals/ recommendations for increased public expenditure on professional, vocational and technical training. The administrative and regulatory affairs of the attached departments, sub ordinate offices and autonomous organizations also come under the domain of the Ministry. It has to develop, standardize and regulate curricula, schedules, institutes and examination / certification bodies for the above trainings to facilitate and provide trained and skilled manpower in consultation with public and private stakeholders. The ministry has to coordinate with other ministries / organizations for optimal utilization of trained manpower and to make employment and employability the central theme of economic and social policies, by making major investment in skill development. Furthermore, it has to setup regular monitoring / evaluation and feedback system for training, to respond efficiently to challenges faced by the country. Moreover, it is responsible to coordinate scholarships / fellowships /

trainings and international assistance in professional, vocational and technical courses and to nominate / recommend award of suitable national honours for eminent persons in the professional and technical training fields. In such a way it has to maintain a data bank of highly qualified and skilled professionals & technicians, through “National Talent Pool”. These roles and responsibilities are clearly elaborating the mandate of ministry of education and its work scope.

The implementation of national TVET policies, programs and projects however rests with the Provincial Governments. In the public sector, the Provincial Governments through technical education and vocational training authorities (TEVTAs) develop and implement policies. The major function of TVETAs is to impart training and provide infrastructure and administrative facilities. They have also been authorized to set their own skill standards, develop curricula and certify courses at provincial levels. The need of time is to revamp the substandard, supply driven and out dated TVET sector of Pakistan and to bring the TVET sector of Pakistan in conformity with international standards, reforming it into demand driven, improved and updated sector in order to ensure employability of its workforce and get an international recognition for its labour force, but same would require a proper and well defined organizational apparatus.

3.1 Comparative analysis of national and provincial level Authorities

The conflicting and overlapping functions of federal and provincial authorities will be discussed under to heads.

3.1.1 Pre 18th amendment scenario

Table 3.1

National Vocational Technical Training Commission	The Punjab Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority Act 2010	The Sindh Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority Act, 2009	CONFLICT/TRANSGRESSION OF AUTHORITY
--	--	--	--

(NAVTTTC) Act 2011			
			<p>The relevant Acts reflect that regulation of TVET is responsibility of both federal and provincial authorities, which is a clear conflict in functions of these authorities. The Preamble of provincial authorities should have acknowledged the national policies and directions given by the NAVTTC or NTB in regulating the TVET sector of respective provinces. The legality of the Act is also needed to be seen in the light of the fact that at the time all these laws were promulgated, the TVET as subject was falling in the legislative competence of the Federal Government and any such enactment and laws providing for development of TVET independent of federal policy and compliance will arise serious constitutional questions as to their mandate.</p>
Preamble.-	Preamble.-Whereas	Preamble.-	<p>The Preamble of the provincial Acts read with NAVTTC Act reflects that regulation of TVET sector is prime object of the authorities in its respective sphere, however, the Sindh TVETA Act has laid down such regulations shall be carried out in close collaboration with industry but has not acknowledged the role of federal and national authorities in such regulations of the sector which is a clear conflict of the organizational apparatus as that that time the subject was vested in legislative competence of the federal government and provinces were under legal and constitutional obligations to follow the policies and directions of the federal government issued time to time.</p>
Function of the NAVTTC Commission.-	Function of Punjab TVET Authority.- The Authority May	Function of Sindh TVET Authority.-	The NAVTTC Act lays down that formulation of policies and strategies for TVET sector in Pakistan is one of the core function of it which has been

<p>The Functions of the Commission shall be to</p> <p>Devise and review policies and evolve strategy relating to human resource development with a focus on vocational and technical training and employment in general.</p>	<p>Provide technical education as it may deem fit, and make provisions for research, service to the society and for the application, advancement and dissemination of technical education in and trade, agriculture and livestock, and services sectors in such manner as determined.</p>	<p>The functions of the authority shall be as follow</p> <p>To formulate technical education and vocational training policies and plans in collaboration with the commission (NAVETC) and SBTE towards the objective of strengthening and bringing these programs in consonance with current industry requirements.</p>	<p>fully acknowledges by the Sindh TVETS act, however, the Punjab TEVTAs Act has empowered it to carry and take steps for betterment and advancement of TVET in its respective regime as such manners it may determine which is in clear conflict with the mandate of federal.</p>
<p>Prepare for approval of the Board, national training plans, programmes and projects in coordination with stakeholders for the expansion of vocational and technical training infrastructure in the country;</p>	<p>Establish and maintain technical institutions, and regulate and administer the institutions under the control of the Authority at the commencement of the Act;</p>	<p>To facilitate establishment of institutional linkage with the industry to ensure that the multiple technical education and skill development programs are aligned to current industry requirement.</p>	<p>The provision is again empowering all the regulating authorities working in respective jurisdiction to carry their functions regarding skill development and expansion of TVET sector in Pakistan without providing for national character of the TVET sector and not providing that provincial authorities shall follow the national projects and policies given by the national authority.</p>
<p>Develop national occupational skill standards, curricula and trade testing certification systems for all sectors in which vocational and technical training is imparted;</p>	<p>Prescribe courses of studies and develop curricula for technical education and may solicit collaboration from other national and international agencies;</p>	<p>To provide policy direction and facilitate resources including financial, manpower vocational training program;</p>	<p>The national and provincial authorities have been empowered to provide policy direction and setting of skill standards and establishment of curricula for their respective jurisdiction, without defining and elaborating the respective jurisdiction. In the light of present statutory function, each authority is independent and justified to set its own standards and place any such curricula which it deems appropriate which is again a clear conflict of functions and is destroying the TVET sector.</p>

Prescribe conditions under which institutions in the public and private sector may be established and operated;	Establish and maintain technical institutions for promoting innovation in technology adoption, and shall provide common facilitation centers and training the workforce in new technologies as per market demand;	To evolve policy framework for the institutional structure, human resource management, policies including recruitment, promotion, placement, staff development and staff benefit scheme;	The provision is fit case for conflict in function of national and provincial authorities for all those who had any doubt regarding such conflicts of functions between federal and provincial authorities. The law is empowering federal and provincial authorities to prescribe conditions for establishment of private technical institutes and what will be the scenario, if conditions laid down are different and how the institutes will be required to follow the conflicting and different conditions so prescribed by these authorities. The reason for non-development and establishment of private sector in Pakistan can safely be attributed to this provision.
Facilitate skill development and employment generation through enhancement of public private partnership;	Decide teaching methods and strategies to ensure effective technical educational and training programs including foreign training	To undertake restructuring of the technical education and vocational training institutions including their merger, closure, overhaul, up gradation towards the objective of unfolding a cohesive, rational and effective institutional framework in the province;	The federal and provincial legislation is asking for skill development through different modes but not asking for organizational harmony in pursuing these policies and steps. The provincial laws have made their authorities completely independent in carrying the functions so assigned to them without realizing the fact that primarily TVET is the federal subjects and provinces are duty bound to follow the directions and guidelines given by the Federal government.
Improve quality of training of instructors through	Take initiatives for placement of trainees or graduates and provide career	To monitor and evaluate technical education and vocational training	The improvement of training of instructors has been defined as function of NATTC along with regulations as to affiliation of technical

skill up-gradation programmes; Regulate affiliation of establishments and institution offering vocational and technical training;	counseling and job search services to the students and alumni; Maintain linkages with alumni;	programs in terms of their effectiveness and ability to cater to market needs and facilitation of skilled manpower in the Province.	and vocational institutes, however, same is being carried out by the provinces in total disregard of the federal mandate. Furthermore, provinces have been conferred the role of monitoring and evaluation of technical training programs which is not the domain of provincial governments particularly before 18 th Amendment, hence a clear case of excess and conflict of authorities which was not even vested in provinces.
Formulate policies for capacity building in the field of vocational and technical training;	Establish and support other facilities for technical education, training including teachers pre-service and in-service training and research;	To evolve and implement technical education and vocational training programs including their curriculum, standards and testing criteria;	The statutory mandate provided under this provision is again in clear conflict with each other and in violations of the constitutional mandate vesting with the Federal government which is being encroached upon by the provincial authorities, affecting the technical and vocational sector of Pakistan badly, even if constitutional mandate is kept aside for the sake of arguments.

The analysis made above has is pre 18th amendment and it has to be looked into as well the TVET as subject was falling in the legislative competence of the Federal Government and all laws, rules, regulations and policies and instructions passed by the Federal Government were binding upon the provinces and no laws and regulations, policies and instructions could have been made and passed in conflict with the constitutional mandate which had very serious legal consequences but such has been the state of priority of TVET sector in Pakistan that no heed has been paid to the constitutional mandate and legalities of legislation even. In such backdrop Pre 18th Amendment Scenario does not reflect a harmonious and integrated organizational hierarchy and apparatus but presents a system comprising of conflicts and divergent structures having all the potential but to streamline and grow a system. An interview with an officer of provincial

TVETA reveals the same picture wherein he was candid enough to state that it has always been up to the provincial authorities to follow any directions and policy given by the federal government and in case of any divergent opinion of provincial TVETs, on any ground results in non-adhering to the said policy/direction which is in clear derogation of the constitutional mandate conferred on the federal authorities and obligated on provinces to follow such policies and instructions issued by the Federal Government for the promotion and advancement of the TVET in Pakistan.

The officer further elaborated and explained that proper chain of command and harmony in organizational apparatus has never been existent in the TVET sector partially owing to duplication of functions among federal authorities in which provincial authorities sometimes receive totally distinct and opposite directions from the respective authorities and seek compliance of the same, which places provincial apparatus under the “does not act mode” having justification for one federal authority like NTB that NAVTTC has given a different direction and guidelines on the subject and vice versa and partially due to the fact that Act so promulgated is giving the look of self-sufficient document in which federal and national directions and policies have not been obligated to follow.³

This has been the priority of the TVET sector that 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan was introduced in 2012 but no amendments in the relevant statutes have been incorporated to remove any such conflicts and violations in the statutes, however all those laws have been amended without wasting any time which falls under the priority of the government including the election laws, however, disorganization of TVET sector has not caught the attention of the relevant federal and provincial authorities to make necessary incorporations to bring all the existing laws in conformity with the constitutional mandate and resultantly the

³Personal Interview to a provincial TVET officer

TVET sector of Pakistan has is falling to the new depths to deprive the country of economic prosperity which it has yielded worldwide. The comparative analysis being made in following lines is more focused with on constitutional mandate of each authority rather than finding conflicts inter se federal and provincial legislation governing the TVET.

3.1.2 Post 18th Amendment Scenario

The post 18th Amendment scenario represents a reversal picture all together, in which TVET as subject has been devolved to provinces but what else is required to gauge the spirit of 18th Amendment in presence of TVET legislation at both national and provincial levels. The 18th amendment was claimed to be aimed at achieving provincial autonomy to ensure that welfare of masses is being safeguarded at local levels, keeping in view the special social, demographic and industry needs when it comes to TVET sector. However, it appears that spirit may have been the same as claimed but priorities were different altogether. The political will is also missing direly in case of TVET both at federal level and provincials level, all those laws wherein political questions were involved have been amended accordingly to bring in conformity with the warrants of 18th Amendment, however, as stated above TVET and many such subjects involving welfare of masses are being run and operated on the pre 18th amendment legal apparatus not only at federal level but also at respective provinces and none has proved an exception. The provinces have started working independently for the so called development of TVET though they were more or less working independently even before the 18th amendment, and no one has paid heed to set the legal regime right for real improvement and betterment of TVET sector as any growth or development without proper organizational and institutional apparatus will be short lived and even counterproductive.

Comparative study and analysis of legislation at federal and provincial level is being made hereunder and for the same NTB Ordinance is being compared with Punjab TVETA Act merely

on the ground that NTB was established as national body having powers and functions in operations and implementation as well as compared to NAVTTC Act.

Table 3.2

Conflicts/Overlaps functions of NTB and Punjab TVETA

THE NATIONAL TRAINING ORDINANCE, 1980.	THE PUNJAB TECHNICAL EDUCATION AND VOCATIONAL TRAINING AUTHORITY ACT 2010.	CONFLICT/TRANSGRESSION OF AUTHORITY.
		The National Training Ordinance 1980 was there to promote, regulate and finance Vocational trainings when the subject was not devolved to provinces (Pre 18th Amendment Scenario). Now the promotion and financing of Technical and Vocational Trainings is a Mandate of Provinces
To constitute Trainings Boards to regulate, promote & finance <u>Vocational</u> Trainings facilities in various fields and to provide financing of trainings programs ⁴	Establish and maintain technical institutions, and regulate and administer the institutions under the control of the Authority at the commencement of the Act. ⁵	There is conflict in functions regarding regulations, promotion and financing of TVET institutions, both the laws are making responsible two different authorities to carry such functions which are in clear conflict with each other. However, NTB have no role in regulations and promotion of TVET now as its in violation of constitutional mandate which has made it provincial subject.
Collaborate with sources of LMI for assessing future training needs		No Such Function Has Been Acknowledged Under The Provincial Laws To Provide Assistance To In Such Collaboration To The NTB. Furthermore, The Mandate Has Totally Changed After The 18 th Amendment As The Subject Has Devolved To The Provinces But No Amendments Have Been Made Accordingly Neither In Federal Legislation Nor In The Provincial. The Function Fits In Even Post 18 th Amendment.
Analyzing the existing training programs & recommendation for improving the	Establish and support other facilities for technical education, training including teachers pre-service	After 18th Amendment Vocational and Technical Training is now provincial subject, therefore NTB has ceased to perform such roles/functions but provincial authorities have failed to bring its laws in conformity

⁴National Training (Amendment) Ordinance, 2002.OrdinancIINo. II Of 2002 An Ordinance

⁵The Punjab Technical Education And Vocational Training Authority Act 2010

quality of trainings. ⁶	and in-service training and research ⁷	with the warrants of the Constitution and probably are not ready for the same.
Establishing criteria for evaluating training programs	Decide teaching methods and strategies to ensure effective technical educational and training programmes including foreign training.	The federal nature of such evaluation has been abolished and Examination and Evaluation of any Technical/Vocational Trainings falls within the preview of Boards of Technical Education and Trade Testing Boards established in each province. However, none of the authority has been willing to follow the dictates of the constitution and status quo is being maintained in clear violation of the constitution.
Developing training syllabi & establishing national training standards	Prescribe courses of studies and develop curricula for technical education and may solicit collaboration from other national and international agencies	The functions assigned and being executed are in violations of constitutional mandate before and after 18 th Amendment as the functions assigned to provincial TVETA were not permissible under the Constitution and after 18 th Amendment, nothing has been done to amend the NTB Ordinance to surrender such functions.
Preparation of national training plans, programs and projects Preparation of national training plans, programs and projects	Provide technical education as it may deem fit, and make provisions for research, service to the society and for the application, advancement and dissemination of technical education in all sectors of economy including industry, commerce and trade.	Provisions of both the laws are in clear contrast to each other, before 18 th amendments function entrusted to Punjab TVETA was in in conflict and after the Amendment, the function of NTB has ceased to exist but no efforts have been made to bring both the laws in conformity with the constitution.
Recommendation to Federal Government for financing training programs	Take initiatives for placement of trainees or graduates and provide career counselling and job search services to the students and alumni	The function of NTB to recommend the federal government may fit in after 18 th Amendment but primarily its now the function of provincial authority to find the ways and options on which such financing is required.
Promote & finance training for officials & instructors		The function of NTB to promote and finance training has also ceased to exist after 18 th Amendment however, no such function has been taken up by the provincial authorities for such financing and promotion of trainings for officials and instructors.
Organize & Conduct training Seminars & Workshops	Establish and maintain technical institutions for promoting innovation in technology adoption, and shall provide common facilitation centres and training the	The operational side of the TVET sector has been taken away from the NTB by the Amendment and now it's clearly the mandate of the provincial authorities to carry out all operational tasks in pursuance of the standards

⁶National Training Ordinance, 1980

⁷The Punjab Technical Education And Vocational Training Authority Act 2010

	workforce in new technologies as per market demand	set forth by the Federal organization as provided under the constitution.
Collect & compile statistic related to trainings		Collection and compilation of date is an important factor for setting standards and providing policy guidelines for the Federal government even after 18 th Amendment, however, the provincial authorities have not made it an obligation to provide and assist in such compilation and collection.
Coordinate the working of provincial Boards/training Authorities		The functions conferred to NTB is no more available after the Amendment and provincial authorities now come up to take that function for such coordination at respective levels.
Review existing & propose legislation on vocational trainings with concurrence of provincial Boards/training Authorities	Institute and award financial assistance to students in need, fellowships, scholarships, bursaries, modals and prizes in the prescribed manner	The legislative competence of Federal government is more available after 18 th Amendment except is setting standards, however, the provincial authorities have also failed to incorporate the function so devolved upon them.
Issues instructions to establishments, provincial boards, Technical Education & Vocational Training Authority or institutions for compliance		The function so assigned under NTO 1980 is violation of the mandate of 18 th Amendment as NTB has no more authority to pass such instructions.
Assist & Establish institutions in collaboration with private sector to promote technical, vocational & in-plant trainings & skill development	Establish linkages with national and international institutions and organizations for the development of technical and vocational education and training system and seeking accreditation or recognition of standards and equivalence to create an internationally employable workforce	Both provisions are in conflict with each other in both pre and post 18 th Amendment scenario and needs to be abolished in one pretext and realigned in other.
Undertake registration & licensing of all establishment, organizations or institutions who provide vocational trainings		NTO 1980 clearly violates mandate of 18 th Amendment. Many Technical Boards of Education & Trade Testing Boards already exist for affiliation and examination and Registration is mandate of Provincial TEVTAs concerned.
Development system & conduct <u>trade testing & certification</u> of skilled workers who have received		The authority vested in NTB is in direct conflict with mandate of 18th Amendment as the Federal Government now have ceased to have such functions and same needs to bring in conformity with the constitutional mandate. Furthermore, provinces are also

trainings through experience or informal system		required to amend respective laws to incorporate all such provisions to serve the TVET sector.
The National Board may set-up such administrative & technical committees, skill development council, authorities, trade testing boards or other such bodies for the efficient performance of its functions as it may consider necessary.	Perform such other functions as may be ancillary, or as may be prescribed by the rules or as may be assigned by the Government	The respective boards have been empowered to carry any act and to establish anybody for discharge of its functions provided under the law, without considering the constitutional mandate of such functions and in present scenario, the functions of NTB are falling in clear conflict with warrants of constitutional provisions.
	Demand and receive such fees and other charges as it may determine.	No constitutional mandate is being negated at present though it had potential to negate the same before 18 th Amendment on the ground if Federal Government decides to make provision of TVET free of cost, so it was not determination by the provincial authority but the Federal Government.

The comparison and analysis of both the statutes sums up the state of organizational set up of TVET in Pakistan and what results and impacts it can yield can be imagined with bare eyes and any such assessment by any ordinary man not related to TVET even will not be wrong as TVET sector in Pakistan is presently as gloomy picture as is being reflected by the laws governing the same.

What else is required by a reader to understand the political will and priority of the state than to study and judge laws on the score. The laws framed for TVET sector of Pakistan as compared and analysed above shows the dismal picture on the part of policy and law makers who have not bothered to follow the constitutional mandate while promulgating the laws. It appears that laws so framed were either politically motivated or a stop gap arrangement only, without devising a comprehensive road map for policy formulation and execution of such policies and laws by federal and provincial authorities while adhering to the constitutional mandate of respective legislation.

Only few legislation appears to have been promulgated while taking into account constitutional mandate or those happens to be at a time when TVET sector was at primitive stage and not much laws were available to provide for conflicts and duplication. NTB has served as national level authority since its inception in 1980 and PTB at provincial levels, however, the roles started to fall in conflict with every subsequent legislation on both federal and provincial level.

3.2 Conflicting/Overlapping inter se Provincial Authorities

The conflicting organizational apparatus is available even at provincial levels and different provincial authorities are functioning under different legal regimes in order to promote and regulate the TVET sector in the province. Provincial Training Board⁸s were established in line with National Training Board in 1980 and are still operative and functional. Subsequently, new organizational apparatus in the shape of provincial technical and vocational authorities have been placed without repealing or realigning respective mandate of such authorities which has created

as much confusions as federal and provincial authorities had created and even more. Furthermore, Punjab Vocational Training Council (PVTC) as an autonomous corporate body was established by the Punjab Government through PVTC Act of 1998 to provide technical and vocational skills to the youth including girls and boys with certain minimum academic qualifications enabling themselves and their families economically in a dignified manner. Resultant thereupon, a coherent and uniformed direction of TVET sector in any of the province is missing. Certain initiatives have been introduced by one authority and certain by the others and sometimes the initiatives may have opposite in nature and hence could have been anything but productive for TVET sector.

The disorganization of TVET sector at provincial level have also created jurisdiction and implementation issues as well both for federal and provincial governments and above all have

⁸National Training Ordinance, 1980

created confusion for the donors who have been actively involved in development of TVET sector of Pakistan since decades in launching an initiative as to which organization is legally competent and capable of completing the same and resultantly the TVET sector of Pakistan has not been placed on right track in spite of huge financial and capacity building contribution by such donors including GIZ, ILO and EU.

An interview with a foreign TVET expert presently serving in Pakistan on behalf of GIZ and entrusted with the task of policy making reflects the same issue of organizational disharmony and conflicts of TVET sector authorities serving in Pakistan. The expert straightforwardly attributed organizational conflicts between federal and federal, federal and provincial and provincial and provincial authorities when was asked to point out the primary reason for the present state of TVET sector in Pakistan. The expert rather questioned how a TVET sector can flourish and compete the world when is devoid of uniformed and integrated organizational apparatus. The expert was also somewhat astonished to see the intentions and developments on part of policy makers who have not bothered to provide a uniformed and well-articulated legal regime for the flourishing and growth of TVET sector in Pakistan. The expert also shared his knowledge of countries having advanced TVET sectors and summed it up by saying that a well-defined organizational apparatus having clear and distinct roles and functions to perform devoid of duplication and conflict has been the only touchstone for such advancement.⁹

The Pakistan's TVET sector is lagging far behind from the advanced countries and even developing countries of the region and Globe and among many reasons for its present state of affairs, the disintegration and disorganization of authorities is one of the core reason. The Pakistan has been ably assisted by international donors in financial, capacity building and human resource as well but still TVET sector in Pakistan is far behind the expected and intended status.

⁹Personal Interview with Foreign TVET expert

An interview was conducted with one of the local TVET expert working with GIZ under TVET Reforms (TRSP) of Pakistan to find out the reasons for dismal performance of the sector. The expert attributed lack of commitment and political will as one of the core reasons for present state of TVET affairs in Pakistan. The duplication and conflict of organizations was another core factor which has not permitted the TVET sector to grow inspite of the fact that many interventions have been introduced mainly funded by donors. The expert was of the view that fragmented and conflicting organizational apparatus have shaken the confidence of donors very badly. He was further of the view that organizational reforms is need of time to TVET sector in the country otherwise Pakistan economy will suffer in huge terms in presence of the youth bulge which is going to hit the country in coming decade and if organizational apparatus is integrated, harmonized both at federal and provincial level then TVET is the sole sector of Pakistan having potential to overturn the fortunes of Pakistan.¹⁰

¹⁰Pakistan Technical & Vocational Education and Training reforms

CONCLUSION

In the highly competitive business environment, there is massive pressure on labour market to fulfill demand with efficient supply of technical or skilled labour force. Considering the importance of skilled or technical work force efforts have been made from government and non-government organizations to enlarge the scope of technical and vocational training system. Pakistan is facing variety of challenges to develop required skills in labour force such as policy design or implementation, system incompetency to dress or resolve on going issues at strategic level. Pakistan is expecting excessive labour inflow in forthcoming years but the current system is not ready to digest it. Present population of Pakistan is 184 million approximately in which median age is 22 years and 60 per cent of the population is under 30 years of age, which is expected to get double over the next 35 years.

Pakistan has a great comparative advantage in labour costs due to large population size but that advantage is being wasted rather getting a huge liability on national economy and proving a disadvantage for the economic development of the country owing to absence of coherent and uniformity of policies, lack of will and above all conflicts and duplication in management of the sector. Technical and Vocational Education (TVE) system is not a major supplier of skills to the country's labour market due to low skill levels which dampen the potential of the labour force to significantly contribute to economic growth and the deficit permeates all sectors: industry, agriculture, services, commerce. The TVET sector of Pakistan meets a very small portion of the demand and the relative share of the applied segment of the tertiary sector is 18.5%, which is far less than most of the countries in the world. Many institutions and jurisdictions at both Federal and Provincial levels are involved in governance of TVET without a clear demarcation of their respective responsibilities and devoid of a focal point for coherent planning for the sector. Such

has been the state of affairs of TVET in Pakistan that the most important stakeholder i.e. the industry which provides employment and is the best known to the required skills and training is not involved in any stage of the TVET delivery owing to the fragmented, duplicated and conflicted organization of TVET sector and has even started to stay away from such input platforms where invited. The importance of developing a broad-based and high quality TVET sector has increased many a folds due to expansion of manufacturing and services sectors in the country necessitating the pre-emptive TVET sector to train as per new technologies and innovations to cater for national and international markets that allows easy flow of investment and people and provides a window for skilled labour of Pakistan to exploit the comparative advantage.

At various levels, innovations and initiatives have been introduced to reform the sector many with the support of international donors, but progress has not matched the challenges due to excessive gap between training reforms and quality of labour work force being produced that must be addressed. Skills development in Pakistan is complex and multi-layered as various bodies are constituted for design and implementation of policies and no proper organization of TVET sector in particular. However, there is little comprehensive information or analyzed data about effectiveness of organizational tools imparting TVET and establishments on skills development and outcomes of training programmes. In the public sector, training is funded by a number of ministries, but its aggregate scale has not been measured with respect to the outcomes. Firstly, publicly funded programmes are developed to address the training and vocational issues faced in Pakistani labour market. Under publicly funded programmes only 7.3 per cent of people aged between 15-24 who are involved in education and training, although this statistic covering a low proportion of total adults.

The TVET sector in Pakistan is suffering badly at both policy making and implementation level owing to many factors and requires fundamental change in thinking that informs TVET at all levels. Vision 2030 has echoed such change by calling for major adaptations and innovation in the education system of Pakistan.¹¹ The paradigmatic shift is required to serve the interests of students and learners rather than of policy makers and implementers by making fundamental changes in all parameters of TVET policy what to offer; who to benefit; what pedagogy and teaching and learning methods to offer and sharing of resources among stakeholders.

The issues of organizational reforms both of TVET system and apparatus have been highlighted and identified in National Education Policy 2009 which has lamented the present state of education in Pakistan including technical and vocational education. The policy has very candidly acknowledged loopholes of the existing system regarding clarity of respective roles and functions of the federal-provincial-district governments which has compounded the confusion due to absence of articulation of clear strategies. The Policy further highlighted the fragmented governance as one of the core issue of present state of education in Pakistan including the TVET. The Policy has rightly identified that centrality of the federating units is a must for improving the sector and stressed heavily on coordination and facilitation among the federating units to reform the sector.

The National Skills Strategy discussed the weaknesses of TVET and the challenges of reform. Such as the lack of labour market relevance of much of the training that is provided, with a failure to deliver the skills that the economy requires. This mismatch is due to a number of factors, including weak links between TVET institutions and employers, outdated technologies used for training, the continued provision of training in occupations that are becoming less

¹¹Vision 2013, Planning Commission of Pakistan.

relevant, the lack of trainee/learner exposure to the realities of working life and inadequate training in soft skills (communication, problem-solving). The Provincial Skills Development Plans continue to reflect the concern about the relevance of current programmes to the developing labour market.

The present TVET system of Pakistan needs urgent action in a wide range of areas including system reforms comprising of overall vision of the sector, sector priorities, governance and revenue generation for the sector.

The present state of affairs in TVET sector of Pakistan is badly needed to be reformed as a system, keeping in view the importance and role TVET has played worldwide and can play in Pakistan with the object to give its due status of a parallel stream of education along with general education and to provide vertical progression within the stream and mobility of its students from and into the general education. Following steps are required to reform to reorganize the TVET sector in Pakistan, Whole-of-Sector View, Policy Coherence, Fragmented Governance, Divide, Absence of Planning and Management and Stakeholder Participation in formation and management of the sector.

The responsibilities of TVET sector are divided at Federal and Provincial levels and at Federal level among different authorities and same is the state of affairs at provincial levels. The responsibilities at Federal level are split for different and often on similar elements primarily between NAVTTC and NTB though NISTE and TTBs have also few functions to perform, CAAD as a ministry is also supervising few functions which is also evident at provincial levels among different authorities like in Punjab TVETA, PVTC and PTB are serving the TVET sector. The present scenario leads to confusion and chaos and deprives to develop a whole of sector

view and analysis thereof and formulation of uniformed and well integrated policies become a distant dream.

The situation warrants for the development of mechanism under which the whole TVET sector can be viewed and analysed for policy formulation purpose and warrants to take immediate action to Constitute a **TVET Advisory Council** under the proper legal mandate to obtain the clear picture of the sector overall and to identify all the duplications, conflicts in consultation with all stake holders particularly industry and donors. The task force be entrusted to point out all fragmented governance and to suggest ways to overcome such fragmentations. The TVET Advisory Council should be constituted with mandate to advise and recommend for coordination, policy formation, implementation and TVET delivery as per national and international market demands under Ministry of Education and Technical Training at Federal level and be made integral part of NAVTTC under the reformed mandate after completion and implementation of its recommendations in letter and spirit which will put the TVET in right direction by organizing the TVET sector as per international best practices and indigenous conditions.

The TVET is so far being dealt under the mainstream education policies having little mention of TVET sector and the mainstream coherent education policies are even a distant dreams owing to its intersections with other national policies. At first instance, the segregation of TVET policy from the Education policy is need of time to make TVET a priority in both government and public perspectives. The formation of TVET policy be based upon the recommendations of TVET Advisory Council and The Ministry of Education and Technical Training be obligated to coordinate and develop clarity with all other ministries and Departments and Statutory Bodies in formation of policy, so all duplications and conflicts do not surface even at the time of policy

launch. Furthermore, it is also required to be made a guiding principle of every national and provincial policies that every point of intersection will be finalized with such intersecting ministries and no program will be implemented but through the main ministry.

The duplication, fragmentation and conflicting governance of TVET is another factor to reform TVET sector as governance determines ability of state to meet its goals and objectives set forth under different policies and laws and also ensures that quality education is being provided to all without any discrimination. The major TVET delivery in Pakistan is directly by the government and even private sector is directly regulated by the government. Keeping in view the constitutional mandate until very recently when education was falling in the concurrent list meaning thereby that Federal laws shall prevail and Federal policy shall be the ultimate goals to achieve both in guidelines and executions. The governance was divided into different jurisdictions at both federal and provincial levels and even further divided among federal and provincial levels, which makes it imperative to have very clear demarcation of responsibilities otherwise it will lead to unclear regimes of accountability and clashes inter se different jurisdictions which has been the exact state of affairs of TVET in Pakistan. The picture is too gloomy that different authorities are not willing to forego their functions after 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan under which the subject has devolved to provinces yet the federal level authorities like NTB, NISTE are performing their functions against the spirit of the mandate of the Constitution so much so that different statutory functions of NAVTTC, an independent statutory body comes in direct conflict with the mandate, yet no effort has been made to remove such conflicts and duplication. The will of the state can be determined from the fact that no legislative body at federal and provincial level has amended its

governing statutes to bring in conformity with the constitutional mandate, the sole exception is province of KP which has established its TVETA Act, in line with constitutional mandate.

The Federal Ministry of Education and Technical Training is obligated to play more effective role to co-ordinate and facilitate the process of removing conflicts, duplication and ambiguities across all the jurisdictions of the country. The conflicts, duplications and overlapping have bearings not only relationships inter se federal and provinces rather within the provinces as well which require urgent resolve, if the TVET sector has to be allowed to be the game changer for the country in presence of the youth bulge.

The role of TVET Advisory Council will be very critical in resolving these conflicts, ambiguities and duplication as it will help to map and clarify through consultative process respective roles of each unit and will suggest required and necessary amendments in existing laws as and when require. However, the post 18th Amendment scenario have made the role of Federal Government as of a facilitator and coordinator and for policy formulations where it will be ably assisted by TVET Advisory Councils of both Federal and Provincial Jurisdictions.

The quality provision of TVET sector is being badly hit by the structural divide among different TVET providers, having different apparatus and equipment and trainers skills that skill level of students having same diploma or certificate vary greatly, hence deny TVET a national status. The only way forward to overcome the structural divide is to place internationally adopted model of qualification framework in which a student is judged on the basis of acquired competencies. The process involves a nationally acceptable curricula, trainers, accreditation and assessment culminating on award of nationally acceptable certificate. Pakistan has just launched its NVQF and qualifications are being developed, along with assessment manuals and operational manuals though it has not been provided the required legal backing to make it a national framework in

letter and spirit. The NVQF has been launched by NAVTTC in consultation with all stakeholders under the TVET Reforms Support Program, ably supported by GIZ as implementing partner. The history of NVQF worldwide reveals that it has been given highest possible legal protection by enacting a national level Act for it, but in Pakistan no legal protection has been conferred to it, so much so that it has not been approved by the Board constituted under NAVTTC Act which would may lead to future complications and this very program face the same fate as any other intervention in TVET sector has faced in Pakistan. Furthermore, the state should also play its role to provide opportunities to presently neglected areas to train the people of such areas for equitable human development across Pakistan by establishing TVET institutions in such areas and the input of TVET advisory body for such provision may be made mandatory. The TVET advisory Council may also be given task to lay out plan for provision of TVET through DeeniMadaris to make it more equitable and ensure access of TVET to all and sundry by ensuring a coherent and unified curricula, equipment and assessment under efficient and organized structural arrangements as about 2 Million students are enrolled in such madaris.

The TVET sector in Pakistan is also being hit in terms of unemployment of trained labour due to mismatch of training and education being imparted and needs of the market, aggravated by lack of planning, policy and conflicts embedded in management. There is also immediate need to align and blend general education with TVET to provide the students acquiring general education relevant to the needs of labour market needs and the proposed TVET Advisory Council be assigned the role to propose the road map for such courses in general education and also to suggest blending of TVET with general education. A Similar proposal of technical matriculation was also made in the Education Policy 2009 and Ministry of Federal Education and Technical Training is pursuing the concept, yet no such initiative can bear fruit to reform

TVETsector unless a clear and specified mandate is placed by removing all organizational conflicts and duplications. The proposal has the potential to uplift the present status of TVET in Pakistan including provision of short courses in the general education to provide a window to the world of work.

RECCOMENDATIONS

The TVET sector in Pakistan is in need of reforms both in organization of TVET sector and organizational apparatus governing TVET. Therefore, in order to organize TVET sector as an independent stream of education having linkages with general education to provide for vertical progression to and from TVET and general education and to strengthen the delivery of TVET with respect to planning, executing and imparting certain recommendations are being made and similarly reforms are being proposed in organizational apparatus at both federal and provincial levels in which Federal level authorities with their respective mandate shall be proposed as per the mandate given under the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan after 18th Amendment to the Constitution.

It is recommended that organizational apparatus of TVET sector shall be made to overcome the duplications, conflicts and overlapping of different TVET authorities at Federal and Provincial levels to enable the TVET organization as mainstream of education to flourish and train the students as per national policies and objectives set forth to meet national and international labour market demands. The 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan shall be the guiding source to recommend such apparatus at both Federal and Provincial levels for respective mandate and interpretation by the Supreme Court of Pakistan.

The recommendations are made, keeping in view the following guiding principles to achieve the organizational harmony and coherence;-

The main curse of the present TVET sector in Pakistan is existence of organizations with duplicated, overlapping and conflicting functions of these organizations which require to be removed, if TVET sector of Pakistan has to contribute in the development of Pakistan. The

duplication, conflict and overlapping create confusion, ambiguity and clashes of organization in discharge of their statutory functions, as to which organization is responsible for what. What is expected of an organization rather the creation of communities of trust and partnerships, having complete understanding to resolve grey areas with mutual respect and trust.

Authorities and individuals serving in such authorities are responsible for the use of funds and other resources and for meeting operational targets, goals and to fulfill statutory obligations on the set standards for discharge of their duties. This means that the relationships between organizations and their lines of reporting must be clear and transparent and further means that the system has the capacity to take account of any breach and violations of statutory obligations and such breaches will never be tolerated.

The operational decisions are required to be made closest to where implantation takes place with a strict observance of set norms and practices.

The whole fabric of the TVET organizational apparatus shall be based upon the principle of synergy and collaboration among all federating units, as no system can flourish while having conflicts and clashes among its constituent units.

The conflict of interest among different constituent units of TVET organization shall be avoided to make it a harmonious and coherent sector in which each unit is striving to achieve the collective objectives in support of others.

The constitutional mandate of Pakistan is required to be understood first before making any recommendation for improvement of organizational reforms in Pakistan, in which though the subject stand devolved to provinces yet the national direction is vesting in federal government.

The Constitutional mandate clearly reflects that national direction of education cannot be denied and Federal Government is under constitutional obligations to provide its due share in reformation of the organizational apparatus of the TVET sector in Pakistan and also to discharge its constitutional obligations in a way to make TVET a national priority though giving the others federating units its due to make it a coherent and uniformed TVET sector. The Supreme Court of Pakistan in Constitutional Petition No. 50 and 69 dated November 25, 2011 has interpreted that “the Federal Government cannot absolve itself from the responsibility of providing free and compulsory basic education to the people of Pakistan” in view of the addition of Article 25-A in the Constitution through the 18th Constitutional Amendment¹².

New legislation is required at both Federal and provincial levels to bring the existing structures and laws in conformity with the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan and to clearly define the federal and provincial roles after the 18th Amendment to the Constitution having following characteristics;-

1. Currently NAVTTC & NTB exist as parallel organizations with almost similar functions/mandate which needs to be eliminated. NTB may be realigned and made as federal TVETA as there is no such authority for Islamabad Capital Authority having legal mandate as that of provincial TVETAs which will allow NAVTTC to serve as Apex national body as per the mandate given under NAVTTC Act 2011.
2. Trade Testing Boards (TTBs) presently existing as parallel to Provincial Boards of Technical Education, be merged to make Federal Board of Technical Education & Vocational Trainings (FBTEVT) for conducting third party examination and assessment as and when proposed federal TVETAs begin to function.

¹² PLD 2011 SC 470 (Petition no 59 & 60 of 2011)

3. Skills Development Councils SDCs shall stand abolished after repeal of NTB ordinance 1980.
4. National vocational qualification framework (NVQF) as launched by the NAVTTC has provided for a nationally acceptable framework on which all stake holders including provincial TVETAs have developed consensus. As such, providing for well-defined origination apparatus for its implementation and executions. However, NVQF has been launched by NAVTTC. It separately needs to be given due legislative protection by the parliament of Pakistan through an Act of the Parliament.
5. The functions/mandate of NAVTTC is required to be realigned to make it an Apex TVET authority at national level as per warrants of constitution of Pakistan. NAVTTC is required to be arranged and reformed at the pattern of HEC by assigning similar tasks in the field of technical education as are provided to HEC under HEC Ordinance, 2002. The HEC is serving as the apex National body for policy making and regulation in General education, and a similar body having the national stature in TVET is need of the time to put the organizational apparatus on right track.

NAVTTC is required to be given status in TVET as that of HEC in general education by making it a real National Apex Body, to provide direction, support and enabling environment for the promotion of technical and vocational trainings in public and private sector; (i) by promoting relevant skills; (ii) By ensuring access, equity for all citizens of Pakistan; (iii) and by exercising quality assurance by monitoring standards in technical and vocational trainings. The NAVTTC Act is required to be amended to having functions to provide policy guidelines, direction and other ancillary matters to provide for organization of TVET sector in Pakistan as per national and international trends and best practices. The Skill Advisory

Council proposed to be created shall function as subsidiary organ of the Commission, which shall have atleast 3 sittings annually to recommend new development and strategies to the Commission and submit compliance and performance of ongoing policies in the country.

The Commission shall also provide career guidance and job placement centres across Pakistan in collaboration with Federal and Provincial TEVTAs. The Commission may also have monitoring role for the performance of TEVTAs, FTEVTA & FBTEVT for any federal government project and to advise the Federal and Provincial governments on proposals for grant of diplomas, certificates by vocational and technical trainings institutions and to suggest ways and means for effective coordination and linkage between vocational and technical training and industry, business and commerce to make vocational and technical training relevant and responsive to market needs including suggest innovative programmes for promotion of vocational and technical training in collaboration with Federal and Provincial TVETAs and suggest performance evaluation parameters for vocational and technical training programmes and conduct performance evaluation of TVET Institutions on recommendation of Federal and Provincial TEVTAs. The Commission may guide, facilitate and provide direction to TEVTAs, FTEVTA, BTEs and FBTEVT in implementation of national policies, and in maintenance of acceptable international standards to produce competent labour force.

6. The NVQF recently has been launched but without approval of the NAVTTC Board even, and have laid down certain authorities for making TVET delivery in Pakistan competency based, those authorities are required to be given proper legal cover and needs to be provided under an amended NAVTTC Act. The mere implementation of NVQF in letter and spirit has potential to reform the TVET sector and make it a nationally uniform and coherent system, if

given proper legal protection under the Act, as is the case in whole world. The countries which have opted for NVQF worldwide have enacted and implemented it through the national level statutes to make it nationally binding and not leaving any doubt and thus eliminated any future breach by any federating units. The statutory protection of the NVQF with assigned roles of the authorities is even more required in the presence of devolution of the subject of education to the provinces and unless there is no statutory protection of its structures and operations, the NVQF may not achieve the desired objectives for which it has been launched.

7. National Training Bureau (NTB) should be realigned and renamed as Federal Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (FTEVTA) having a separate legal mandate for conducting trainings within ICT or may be given mandate for Gilgit Baltistan. The roles and functions of FTEVTA needs to be clearly defined in line with the functions of other provincial TVETs working in provinces. The NTO Ordinance 1980 as amended in 2002, should be repealed and the FTEVTA Act should make it successor of NTB which will allow the employees of NTB to assume their new roles. It will avoid displacement of presently serving employees of the NTB and also to assets of TVET will remain within TVET. Furthermore, creation of FTEVTA as successor of NTB will avoid litigation from the employees of NTB. NTB was already executing body in its one of the functions so will assume primary role to maintain standards and ensure that quality trainings are imparted under the proposed arrangement.
8. The functions of Trade Testing Boards (TTBs) have been taken away by the provincial boards so established in each province to carry out the examinations and other ancillary matters, therefore Trade testing boards are need to be abolished being redundant and performing no

functions practically and should be replaced with Federal Board of Technical Education and Vocational Training (FBTEVT) to for Federal Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority proposed to be established above on the same pattern as in provinces the provincial boards for Technical Education and vocational training are performing functions. The Federal Board of Technical Education and Vocational Trainings be assigned the similar functions as those of provincial boards.

9. TVET Advisory Council under the proper legal mandate to obtain the clear picture of the sector overall and to identify all the duplications, conflicts in consultation with all stake holders particularly industry and donors. The task force be entrusted to point out all fragmented governance and to suggest ways to overcome such fragmentations. The TVET Advisory Council should be constituted with mandate to advise and recommend for coordination, policy formation, implementation and TVET delivery as per national and international market demands under Ministry of Education and Technical Training at Federal level and be made integral part of NAVTTC under the reformed mandate after completion and implementation of its recommendations in letter and spirit which will put the TVET in right direction by organizing the TVET sector as per international best practices and indigenous conditions.

10. An Independent National TVET Policy

An independent National TVET policy from that of mainstream main stream education policies having little mention of TVET sector is strongly recommended. Therefore, at first instance, the segregation of TVET policy from the Education policy is need of time to make TVET a priority in both government and public perspectives. The formation of TVET policy be based upon the recommendations of TVET Advisory Council and The Ministry of

Education and Technical Training be obligated to coordinate and develop clarity with all other ministries and Departments and Statutory Bodies in formation of policy.

Bibliography

- Atta-ur-Rehman, Kemal, A. R., Siddiqui, R., Din, M.-u., & Nasir, Z. M. (2005). Technology based Industrial Vision and Strategy for Pakistan's Socio-economic Development (Draft). Pakistan Institute of Development Economics, Higher Education Commission, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad.
- Cuddy, N., & Leney, T. (2005). Vocational education and training in the United Kingdom Thessaloniki, Greece. European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (CEDEFOP).
- Department of Education. (1994). Technical Education and Skills Development Act of 1994 (with Implementing Rules and Regulations), 1995. Declaration of Policy". Republic Act. No. 7796
- Federal Government. (2009). National Education Policy 2009. Ministry of Education Government of Pakistan.
- Federal Government. (2011). National Vocational and Technical Training Commission Act. TVET Department, Act No. XV Of 2011.
- Federal Government. (2012). National training board. NTB ordinance 1980 , Section 4, as amended in 2002.
- Government of Pakistan. (1973). The Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973. Federal legislative Authority.
- Government of Pakistan. (2011). Education Department . Pakistan's technical and vocational education and training reform 2011.
- Government of Pakistan. (2014). Pakistan Labour Force Survey. Pakistan Bureau of Statistics.
- Government of Pakistan. (2014). Profession wise profile of Pakistani migrant workers. Bureau of emigration and overseas employment.
- Government of Pakistan. (2014). Workers' remittances . State bank of Pakistan.
- Haider, Z. (2013). Importance of Vocational Training in Pakistan . Pakistan Get Better Soon.
- International Labour Organization (2010a). Qualifications Frameworks: Implementation and Impact. Background Case Study on Sri Lanka. Geneva, International Labour Office.
- International Labour Organization (2010b). The implementation and impact of National Qualification Frameworks: Report of a study in 16 countries. Geneva, International Labour Office.
- Jinnah, Q. (1947). Speech . Karachi: presented at first education conference .

- Philippines Education Department. (2015). Education for All 2015 National Review.
- Provincial Government. (2009). Sindh Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority Act. TVET Department, Act No: VIII of 2010.
- Provincial Government. (2010). The Punjab Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority. TVET Department, Act 2010.
- Provincial Government. (2011). Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority Act 2011. TVET Department, Act No. II Of 2011.
- Provincial Government. (2015). Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority. TVET Department, Act, 2015.
- Sellin, B. (2002). Scenarios and strategies for vocational education and lifelong learning in Europe: Summary of findings and conclusions European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training . CEDEFOP.
- United Nations. (2013). Total Migrant Stock at Mid-Year by Origin and Destination. United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division.
- World Bank. (2013). Remittances. World bank publications.
- World Bank. (2007). Skill developemnt in India: The vocational education and training system. Human Development Unit.
- Yang, G. T. (1998). The Interaction between Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) and Economic Development in Advanced Countries. Elsevier Science Ltd.