

Organisational Conflicts and Duplications in TVET Sector at Federal Level: Analysis of Pakistan

MUHAMMAD IMRAN and NAUSHEEN MOHYUDDIN

Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) is essential for the attainment of socio-economic well beings in Pakistan having growing and abundant labour work force in the country. Well-organised working of TVET system enhances the chances of employability, career development and sustainable livelihood. The success of (TVET) sector strongly hinges upon smooth running and well defined roles of organising and controlling bodies. A well-defined TVET sector embodies a coordinated, coherent and an organised TVET authorities working under a proper hierarchy, accountable for execution of their plans. However, TVET sector in Pakistan is beset with overlapping and conflicting functions at three points: Conflicts/overlaps among Federal Ministries/institutions; conflict/overlaps between Federal and Provincial institutions/authorities and conflicts/overlaps among Provincial Ministries/departments. However, this study takes into account the duplications and conflicts among federal level authorities. The study will understand the nature and extent of conflicts and duplication of functions and its impact on performance of TVET sector in Pakistan. The youth bulge which is going to engulf Pakistan in coming decade can be converted into production bomb having the potential to overturn fortune of Pakistan by placing a uniformed and coherent apparatus in place.

Keywords: TVET, Socio-economic Well-being, National Training Pakistan

1. INTRODUCTION

The branch of learning aimed at increasing opportunities for work, sustainable livelihoods, socio-economic development and personal empowerment in knowledge economies refers to Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET). Technical and Vocational Education and Training is only tool to acquaint the individuals with the skills to meet demands of today's society warranting them to have knowledge, practical and social skills and above all ability to adapt and correspond to the ever changing work environments.

Skills development sector in Pakistan historically have been neglected and incapable of meeting the set targets and in upgradation of skills in Pakistan as per local and international market demands. Pakistan is having population of 184 million, out of which 60 percent is under 30 years of age, and the median age is 22 years.¹ The estimated statistics suggest that the working age population will double over the next 35 years. Low productivity, inadequate training, poor and outdated modes of imparting TVET relative to international standards and requirements are the main characteristics of the TVET sector of Pakistan. Pakistan has given attention to TVET since its inception, but the major complaints have been regarding the irrelevance of training imparted, Ineffective policies and

Authors are Legal Officer in GB Council Secretariat, Ministry of Kashmir Affair and Gilgit-Baltistan, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad and Director NAVTTC, Islamabad.

¹Bureau of Statistics, Population Survey Report 2014. Government of Pakistan.

governance. Pakistan needs to streamline TVET structure to produce skilful employable workforce, capable of competing in the international labour market and local industry.

At present, the TVET sector in Pakistan is suffering both in organisation of the sector and the organisational apparatus governing the sector. The TVET sector has neither been acknowledged as a stream of education due the lack of political will, a proper TVET policy, resources, modes of imparting TVET nor the organisational apparatus governing the TVET has capacity to reform due to duplications and conflicts among different authorities established to regulate the TVET. Different authorities have been established both at National and Provincial levels to equip major chunk of workable population with skills and lifelong learning but those have not performed as expected and resultant Pakistan is lagging behind. The underperformance can be attributed to conflicting and overlapping provisions among federal and provincial authorities regarding their functions and duties. This has led to the confusion among different authorities and chain of command in streamlining the TVET sector in Pakistan. Furthermore, the 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan has devolved the subject of education to provinces, leaving only standards in TVET in the federal competence. This has led to more confusion and affecting the governance many fold, as provincial authorities have started to make policies of their own without taking into account federal standards. Some federal level authorities have overlapping functions for which they are not mandated. The situation has worsened in the backdrop of the fact that neither at national nor provincial level efforts have been made to reconcile and make a comprehensive/compatible legislation to eliminate and overcome the overlapping and conflicting provisions to ensure proper governance. There are various authorities functioning at federal level with either overlapping functions or those which are not mandated.

The study intends to make a comprehensive analysis of fragmented governance, conflicting and overlapping provisions in applicable laws regulating the TVET. This is an inclusive study conducted to draw insight from the past, enquire about the contemporary approaches and to understand and analyse conflicts and duplications affecting TVET sector at federal level and suggests a way forward for policy formation with the aim to improve TVET sector in Pakistan having capacity to incorporate the youth bulge in productive economy in coming years having potential to overturn the fortune of Pakistan. The study will help future researchers, policy makers and public policy students in formation of appropriate policy making to address the problems of fragmented governance, conflicting and overlapping provisions in laws regulating the TVET and analytical study regarding TVET and organisational structures in Pakistan.

2. STRUCTURE, DUPLICATIONS AND CONFLICTS AT FEDERAL LEVEL

The Technical and Vocational Training worldwide has acquired a pivotal importance over a last decade, the developed world had accepted its significance in developing their economies long time ago by bringing their TVET sector on the right path regarding modes and tools of acquisition of skills and harmonious organisational apparatus in which each authority has been assigned with distinct and clear cut roles to play and an organisational environment where functions of each TVET unit helps to

boost the sector and achieve the national goals set forth but the developing countries took some time to realise its importance and the role it can play in boosting the economy and uplifting the standards of living, resultantly are lacking in direction and apparatus too. Sri Lanka joined the race in 1997 and India somewhere in 1995 (Source). Pakistan tried back in 70s to export the surplus labour to Middle East, Saudi Arabia and some European countries but the work force were lacking in compatible skills. As the new trends and terms evolved the importance of skilled labour became indispensable and world trade organisation (WTO) and International labour Organisation (ILO) started defining these terms accordingly hence distinguishing the skilled, certified, licensed, accredited workforce from semi-skilled or basic skilled workers and Pakistan is lagging behind in terms of higher skills. In this chapter organisational apparatus of TVET authorities serving at federal level will be looked into with special reference to the conflicting and overlapping statutory provisions available in the respective laws governing such authorities which inter alia render such authorities counterproductive. The duplication of functions among such authorities serving at the national level have yielded to claims and counter claims from the authorities to be the apex body and having the mandate to carry the function so assigned which have done nothing but to destroy the whole organisational structure of TVET sector in Pakistan.

Article 37 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan has made it obligations of the government to provide for availability of Technical and Professional Education and to make higher education equally accessible on the basis of merits. The state shall has been obligated to enable its citizen to participate fully in all forms of national activities, including employment in the services of Pakistan through education, training, agriculture and industrial development and other methods.²

The state obligation set forth in the above referred provision of Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan has been tried to comply with by establishing different authorities at federal and provincial levels with an aim to promote and develop TVET sector in Pakistan as per set standards and market demands.

3. NATIONAL TRAINING BOARD

National Vocational and Technical Training Commission

National Vocational Technical Education Commission (NAVTEC) was established in 2005 instead of (NTEVTA) with following among other mandate;-

- Constitution of Trainings Boards for regulation, promotion & finance of Technical Vocational Education and Training,
- Provision of regulation, Coordination and policy direction for Vocational and Technical Training,
- Provision of an autonomous organisation for Technical Vocational Education and Training
- Setting up and review policies and to evolve strategy for human resources development,

²The Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.

- Introduction of new instructional and communication technologies to bridge the widening gap between planning and implementation of Technical Vocational Education and Training,
- The Commission may set-up administrative and technical Committees, Working Groups, Skilled Development Councils, Trade Testing Boards or other such Bodies and entrust them such functions as it may consider necessary to effectively perform its functions.³

National Vocational and Technical Education Commission during the initial years couldn't focus on its mandate and got involved primarily in trainings. Therefore, it was realised that its core objectives were far more different than what it was actually doing, the National Vocational and Technical Education Commission became National Vocational and Technical Training Commission (NAVTTTC) under NAVTTTC Act 2011 to serve as Federal Apex Body for regulation, coordination and policy direction for vocational and technical training and for matters ancillary thereto or connected therewith.

The functions listed above reveals that even the constitutional mandate as provided after 18th amendment to the constitution of Islamic republic of Pakistan under which the subject of education stand devolved to the provincial have not been adhere to. The functions assigned to the National Vocational and Technical Training Commission of Pakistan have been assigned even without considering functions of other Technical Vocational Education and Training bodies serving in Pakistan nor overriding clause has been attributed to National Vocational and Technical Training Commission to make it an apex body at the national level. The idea to establish National Vocational and technical training Commission of Pakistan was probably borrowed from Higher Education Commission of Pakistan however one basic factor the most crucial was over looked whiling promulgating the National Vocational and Technical Training Commission Act that Higher Education Commission Pakistan was established as successor of university grant commission.

The fact of existence of national training bureau was over looked which has been assigned the functions to serve as a national authority for Technical Vocational Education and Training in Pakistan. The establishment of another national level authority was bound to create confusion, duplication, conflicts and overlapping unless the already existing authority has not been repealed and the newly established authority is made as successor of the former.

National Vocational and Technical Training Commission has been established as an autonomous body which has the potential to weaken its authority and execution of plan/programs and compliance thereof. The situation is bound to get worsen due to the fact that a national level authority in the shape of NTB is already serving the Technical Vocational Education and Training sector of Pakistan and furthermore devaluation of subject of education to the provinces would create more complications in smooth and efficient working of National Vocational and Technical Training Commission in achieving the objects for which it has been establish.

National Vocational and Technical Training Commission Act 2011, however is somewhat detailed document that assigns it additional responsibilities to cover the

³National Vocational and Technical Training Commission Act, 2011 Act No. XV Of 2011.

Technical Vocational Education and Training sector more appropriately e.g. Accreditation of Technical Vocational Education and Training institutes, establishment of endowment fund for Technical Vocational Education and Training sector, regulations in Technical Vocational Education and Training for quality control, national & international linkages, access, delivery and equity in system as compared to NTB, probably due to the lessons learnt through National Training Broad.

NAVTTTC's Achievements

The National Vocational and Technical Training Commission since its establishment have been striving to achieve goals for which it has been constituted but the performance has not been up to the mark as anticipated owing to the presence of similar nature of authority at apex level and organisational disharmony in the commission itself. The rapidly changing Technical Vocational Education and Training sector worldwide requires a pre-emptive and proactive organisational apparatus at all jurisdictions to meet present and future needs of the labour market worldwide. The NAVTTTC was established with the same spirit to provide directions to TVET sector of Pakistan keeping in view national and international demands of both present and future, however the performance and achievements of NAVTTTC till date are far less satisfactory.

The biggest ever achievement of NAVTTTC is launch and formulation of National Skills Strategy (NSS-2009-2013) which has provided to bring institutional, organisational and developmental pattern of TVET sector in Pakistan. The NSS is also unique in the sense that it brought federal and provincial authorities on the same page in order to bring TVET reforms in Pakistan and first ever time in the history of Pakistan the federal and provincial authorities pledged to work in conformity and in support of each other as per constitutional mandate. The Commission has also compiled online data base of 63,159 students, sponsored trainings. The Commission has also intervened to create access and to ensure equality in 79 uncovered Tehsils in the country. Twenty industrial advisory groups have been constituted to ensure private sector involvement in National Vocational and Technical Training Commission's functions. Skill standards & curricula of 106 vocational trades and technologies have also been developed.

The NAVTTTC has also introduced TVET Reforms Support Program, a five-year initiative launched in April 2011, supports National Vocational and Technical Training Commission (NAVTTTC) in the centre and Technical Education and Vocational Training Authorities (TEVTAs) and other partners in the provinces and regions in implementing the NSS 2009-2013 reform agenda. The TVET Reform Support Program is co-funded by the European Union, the Embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands and the Federal Republic of Germany and being implemented by GIZ. It aims to assist the Pakistani governments at the central and provincial levels to implement the NSS. The Component 2 of this program is to foster the establishment and implementation of the National Qualifications Framework and the human resource development for TVET.

The NAVTTTC has launched Pakistan National Vocational Qualification Framework as a first product of objectives set forth in National Skills Strategy 2009. The NVQF has indirectly aimed at achieving the goals of organisational, institutional and pursuance of policy by all federal and provincial authorities in their respective mandate but in a manner which is integrated, uniformed and coherent. Improvement of quality of

TVET and to increase achievement of skills and knowledge as per industry's needs is main objectives of NVQF, to be achieved through unified and coherent policies that ensure the quality of achievements in TVET. NVQF has also proposed a national qualifications system, by providing pathways for entry, progress and achievement of such qualification. NVQF has also allowed credit accumulation to trainers and has proposed a system of equivalences, allowing transfer from one qualification to another, and horizontal and vertical progress is one of the main characteristics of NVQF and has also provided for recognition of prior informal learning.

National Institute of Science and Technical Education

Another authority at federal level under a separate ministry of Capital Administration and Development Islamabad is also operating at federal level. National Institute of Science and technical education (NISTE) has been established in 1997 by merging institute for promotion of science education and training (IPSET) and national technical teacher training college (NAVTTTC). (NISTE) claims and appears to be an apex institution of Ministry of (CAAD) to cater futurist needs at national and regional level in the field of science and technical education. (NISTE) has developed and implemented at the national level research based curricula and teaching learning resources (TRL) manual for science subjects up to secondary level and technical subjects up to diploma of associate engineering long with reforms of examination system.

Trade Testing Boards

NTB continued to serve as sole federal authority till 2005, when it was realised that NTB has failed to yield the desired results and paved way for the establishment of National Vocational and Technical Training Commission. The establishment of National Vocational and Technical Training Commission at Federal level without realigning/amending the functions of NTB as per National Vocational and Technical Training Commission Act 2011 has resulted in conflicting and overlapping functions of both the authorities which has led to the organisational conflicts and resultantly both authorities are unable to perform respective functions assigned under the respective Laws. The 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan have devolved the subject of technical education to the provinces which will be discussed in detail in chapter 3 however, it has highlighted the conflicting and overlapping provisions as both the authorities perform respective functions provided under the Laws but that turns out to be transgression of other authorities and resultantly none of the authority is able to perform its statutory functions. The conflict and overlapping has done nothing but to derail already neglected Technical Vocational Education and Training sector of Pakistan lacking capacity to meet international standards and national and international market demands.

Comparative Analysis of NTB Ordinance and NAVTTTC Act 2011

Both the laws have been promulgated to constitute federal authorities at national level with an aim to promote and strengthen Technical Vocational Education and Training sector of Pakistan and to bring it at par with the advanced sector in the world.

The first such legislation was creation of NTB however, as discussed above it failed to yield the desired results and resultantly new legislation was done with the same objective. The establishment of a national authority in presence of already existing authority always demands to avoid duplication of roles and conflicting provision therein, otherwise such establishment yields more organisational chaos and disharmony and always counterproductive.

Table 1

Comparison of Functions/Mandate of NAVTTC Act 2011 With NTB Ordinance 1980

Particulars National Training Ordinance 1980 Amended in 2002	Particulars National Vocational Technical Training Commission (NAVTTC) Act 2011	Particulars Conflict in Functions/Duplication of Functions
CORE RESPONSIBILITY:		CORE RESPONSIBILITY:
Functions:	Functions:	
Sec4(i) Collaboration with Labour Market and assessment of future needs.	Sec6 (o),Sec 6(a),6(p) & Sec6(s) Carry out Training Needs assessment Devise & review policies & evolve strategy relating to human resources development with a focus on Vocational & Technical Trainings and employment in general. Prepare and maintain a data bank of institutions and establishments imparting vocational and technical training. Etc,	Both authorities are to regulate however NTO 1980 regulates only Vocational Trainings whereas NAVTTC Act lays down regulating both vocational and technical training, however, the regulation of vocational training has been assigned to both the authorities which is in conflict with each other. Both the authorities have empowered under the respective law to develop Labour Market Information System with reference to future training requirements. However, more emphasis has been laid down under NAVTTC Act for establishment of such system under section 6(o), (p), 6(s) and 6(t).
Sec 4(ii) Analysis of existing trainings projects & recommendation for its improvement.	Sec 6(a) & Sec 6(b) Devise and review policies and evolve strategy relating to human resource development with focus on vocational and technical training and employment in general.	Both the authorities have been assigned similar task to give recommendations and evolve strategies for improvement of quality of trainings.
Sec 4(iii) Establishment of criteria to evaluate training programs.	Sec 6(e), Sec 6(h), Sec 6(l) & Sec 6(r) Prescription of conditions for establishment and operation of TVET institutes in public and private sector. Regulations for affiliation of TVET institutes.	There is clear duplication of functions of both the authorities regarding setting criteria for evaluation of training programmes which is liable to create conflicts for the institutions imparting such programmes of whose directions and criteria is to be followed in case two different criteria is laid down by the respective authorities and is always liable to exploitations by imparting institutions which will then pick and choose as per its needs.
Sec 4(iv) Development of syllabi & establishment of national standards in TVET.	Sec 6(d) & Sec 7(e) Development of national standards in TVET, curricula & Certification. Regulation for quality control in implementing skills standards, syllabi, trade testing, certification of TVET instructions	The development of training syllabi and establishment of national training standards have been assigned to both the authorities. The provision is gain a glaring case of duplication and conflict for training imparting authorities and institutions to which syllabi and standards to be followed and what will be the competence of students who acquiring skills through different syllabi and standards. Furthermore, on which syllabi and standards such students are to be tested and examined by the testing boards.

Continued—

Table 1—(Continued)

Sec 4(v) Supervision of federally funded training programs.	Sec 6 (r) Suggest performance evaluation parameters for vocational and technical training programmes and conduct performance evaluation of technical and vocational institutes	Both the authorities have been assigned the supervisory role for the training programmes funded by federal government. The provision is again a serious source of duplication and giving rise to conflict. The federal government may get two different reports on the performance and conduct of a training program by the respective authority both serving at the national level and aspiring to be the national body for the purpose and such situation is liable to create dilemma for the federal government which report to accept and relied upon and which not.
Sec 4 (vi) Preparation of national training plans, programs and projects	Sec 6(t), Sec 7(h) & Sec 6(q) Suggest ways & means for effective coordination and linkages between Vocational & Technical Training and industry, business and commerce to make Vocational & Technical Trainings relevant & responsive to market needs. The Commission may launch/approve projects up to ceiling fixed by the federal Government for DDWP	The functions assigned to both the authorities are leading to create confusion and leading to affect TVET sector in Pakistan in the manner which is taking it no where. The preparation and launch of any plan to be implemented is the basic step for improvement and efficient performance of any system, and requires to be a unified and coherent one to achieve desired results. The provision referred reflects that both authorities are having duplications. The preparation of national training plans, programs and projects have been assigned to both the authorities without defining respective areas which is bound to be source of confusion and conflicts for execution of such plans, programs and projects and many cases such plans may not have been executed or implemented due to divergence of plans, programs and projects by the respective authorities and also a source of real confusion and may have approval of federal government of a similar nature of plan, program or project or vice versa of each authority which has done nothing but to derail the growth and development of TVET sector in Pakistan.
Section 4(vi) Recommendation to Federal Government for financing training programs	Sec7(f), Sec.7(c) & Sec. 7(a) Advise the Federal Government and Provincial Governments on proposals for grant of diplomas and certificates by vocational and technical training institutions; Allocate funds for infrastructure development, training of faculty as an incentive to improve quality of Vocational & Technical Trainings;	There cannot be more glaring conflict and duplication of functions as is available in the present provision in which federal government has been obliged to get recommendations from the respective authority for financing training programs. The provision has not specified the areas for which one authority can recommend and other not which shall yield only conflict and confusion if two opposite and different programs have been recommended by the two authorities and which such program federal government will select for financing and what will be the scenario if two opposite programs have been approved by the federal government.
Section 4(vii) Promote & finance training for officials & instructors	Sec. 6(g), Sec. 6(u) & Sec 7(c) Improve quality of trainings of instructors through skills up-gradation programmes; Formulate & recommend strategies for pre-service & in-service trainings of Vocational & Technical Training staff;	The promotion and financing of training for officials and instructors have been assigned to both the NAVTTC and NTB without defining respective jurisdictions and fields for such trainings and financing thereof. The available provision is another fit case of duplication and giving rise to confusion only and leading the TVET sector nowhere except the backward.

Continued—

Table 1—(Continued)

<p>Section 4(ix) Organisation and Conduct of training Workshops.</p>	<p>Sec.6(j) Organisation of workshops, symposia, Seminars& seminars, and panel discussions on matters pertaining to TVET.</p>	<p>The provisions under discussion represents that both the authorities serving at national level have been assigned similar tasks which is a clear case of conflict and duplication, and have the potential to damage growth and performance of the sector. This provision is the ultimate proof of duplication and conflict in functions of both the authorities, if any doubt was left in mind of a child aspiring to find out reasons for formal state of affairs of TVET sector in Pakistan. The law has allowed both the NAVTTC and NTB to conduct and organise training workshops and seminars though NAVTTC Act has included two more modern words of symposia and panel discussions which were probably not known in the year 1980, the time when NTO was promulgated.</p>
<p>Section 4(x) Collection & compilation of statistic of trainings.</p>	<p>Sec. 6(p) Preparation & maintenance of data bank relating to TVET institutes and establishments.</p>	<p>The collection and compilation of statistics and data has been made function of both NAVVTC and NTB by respective statutes, however, whose statistics and data will be relied upon in case of divergent findings, is a question to be looked into and liable to create only confusions and disharmony in TVET sector of Pakistan and which has been casted so.</p>
<p>Section 4(xi) Coordinate the working of provincial Boards/training Authorities</p>	<p>Sec. 6(m) Coordinate with the provincial Governments in the field of Vocational & Technical Trainings</p>	<p>Both the authorities working on federal level in the same filed have been entrusted with the same task to coordinate working of provincial boards and training authorities. The provision has defeated the federal status of both the authorities and a source of great confusions and inaction for provincial authorities and boards to which federal authority coordination is mandatory, and resultantly the present state of TVET sector reflects that probably there is no coordination at federal and provincial level and only the duplication of functions of similar nature of authorities have to be blamed for this.</p>
<p>Section 4(xii) Review and propose laws for TVET with concurrence of provincial Authorities.</p>	<p>Sec. 6(n) Review and recommend laws & regulations for TVET.</p>	<p>NAVTTC and NTB both have been empowered to review existing laws and propose legislation in the field of vocational and technical training and vocational training respectively. This is such a glaring duplication and overlapping of function that the relevant statutory provision which is giving these authorities power to review and even recommend appropriate legislation without defining respective mandate on which to review and recommend has led to the organisational conflicts between both the authorities wherein both claim to be validly empowered for such task and creates disharmony.</p>
<p>Section 4(xiii) Issues instructions to establishments, provincial boards, Technical Education & Vocational Training Authority or institutions for compliance.</p>	<p>Sec. 7(d) Set up such administrative and technical committees, working groups, skill development councils, trade testing boards or other such bodies and entrust them such functions as it may consider necessary.</p>	<p>Both the authorities have been empowered under the respective laws constituting and regulating the authority to pass such and necessary instructions to any establishment, provincial boards, technical education or institutions for compliance. This provisions is the ultimate source of conflict as both the authorities have been bestowed the commanding role to seek compliance from other technical and vocational authorities and institutions, and the authorities are duty bound to comply even the different and opposite directions passed by the NTB and NVTTC. The seeds of organisational conflicts and disharmony are apparent in the said provision taking the TVET sector to the lowest ebb, it is falling at present.</p>

Continued—

Table 1—(Continued)

Section 4(xiiia) Assist & Establish institutions in collaboration with private sector to promote technical, vocational & in-plant trainings & skill development	Sec. 6(e) & Sec6(f) Facilitate skill development and generation through Public-Private Partnership;	Similar provision has been provided under the laws to establish institutions and assist in such establishment in collaboration with private sector for the promotion of TVET and skill development. However, such conflict in functions and duplication thereof can never serve to promote TVET and skill development which is very imminent in TVET sector of Pakistan.
Section 4(xiiib) Undertake registration & licensing of all establishments, organisations or institutions who provide vocational trainings	Sec 6(i) Sec. 6(h) Issue regulations for licensing of Federal establishments & institutions and Regulate affiliation of establishments & institutions offering vocational technical trainings	The registration, affiliation and licensing of institutions imparting TVET is subject of both NTB and NAVTTC. The provision have effectively created two distinct regimes for such registration, licensing and affiliation and a total confusion for TVET institution where to get such license, affiliation and registration and a tool to keep students away from TVET as an institution having registration from one authority may prorogate against other having registration, affiliation and license from other.
Section 4(xiiic) Development system & conduct trade testing & certification of skilled workers who have received trainings through experience or informal system	Sec. 6(f) Determine equivalence and recognition of diplomas, certificates awarded by institutions within the country and abroad.	Again similar powers have been given to both the authorities in developing system for recognition of trainings through experiences and informal system of <i>ustad-shagird</i> . The recognition of prior learning is an important part of TVET sector in Pakistan as it trains about 70 % of labour force in Pakistan, yet the provision under discussion reflects that no priority has been assigned to it rather duplicated functions are created.
Section 4(2)	Sec. 7(d)	Both NTB and NAVTTC have been empowered to establish and constitute committees, skill development councils, trade testing boards for efficient discharge of their similar functions, which is only liable to create conflicts in betterment of TVET sector and confusion thereof.

The comparison and analysis of the two organisations both serving at the federal level reveals that almost similar nature of authorities have been established under different laws to serve at the same national level and having almost similar functions to perform speaks about the sincerity and commitments of state towards the TVET sector. The proposal to enact the subsequent law must have been initiated by the concerned ministry dealing with TVET and was in clear knowledge that a national level authority NTB is serving having very clear mandate and the official documents reveals that failure of NTB was made basis of new national level authority, then how it can be imagined that a similar nature of authority having almost identical functions can be created without amending or realigning the existing one, if not abolished and in presence of Law and Justice Division of the Government of Pakistan which goes through every new proposed enactment before the Bill is presented for enactment.

Conflicting/Overlapping Functions of (NISTE), NAVTCC and NTB

The main objectives of NISTE as discussed above to provide quality in technical education falls in direction conflicts with the mandate/ functions of NAVTTC and NTB as discussed above. The NISTE also aspire to cater futuristic needs both at national and

regional level in the field of technical education which is the main function of NAVTTC and NTB respectively. NISTE has also developed and even implemented at the national level the research based curricula and Teaching Learning Resources Material (TRL) for diploma of associate engineers which again is in the direction conflict with the functions of NAVTTC and NTB. NISTE function to reform examination system falls in conflict with the mandate of technical trainings broads (TTBs) and vice versa. All these mentioned conflicts/ overlapping in statutory provisions of TVET authorities have led to fragmented and disorganised governance and badly effecting the TVET sector of Pakistan, highlighting the need to remove such conflicts/ overlapping/duplication sooner than later.

4. CONCLUSIONS

In the highly competitive business environment, there is massive pressure on labour market to fulfil demand with efficient supply of technical or skilled labour force. Pakistan has a great comparative advantage in labour costs due to large population size but that advantage is being wasted rather getting a huge liability on national economy and proving a disadvantage for the economic development of the country owing to absence of coherent and uniformity of policies.

At various levels, innovations and initiatives have been introduced to reform the sector many with the support of international donors, but progress has not matched the challenges due to excessive gap between training reforms and quality of labour work force being produced that must be addressed. Skills development in Pakistan is complex and multi-layered as various bodies are constituted for design and implementation of policies and no proper organisation of TVET sector in particular. However, there is little comprehensive information or analysed data about effectiveness of organisational tools imparting TVET and establishments on skills development and outcomes of training programmes. In the public sector, training is funded by a number of ministries, but its aggregate scale has not been measured with respect to the outcomes. Firstly, publicly funded programmes are developed to address the training and vocational issues faced in Pakistani labour market. Under publicly funded programmes only 7.3 per cent of people aged between 15-24 who are involved in education and training, although this statistic covering a low proportion of total adults.

The TVET sector in Pakistan is suffering badly at both policy making and implementation level owing to many factors and requires fundamental change in thinking that informs TVET at all levels. Vision 2030 has echoed such change by calling for major adaptations and innovation in the education system of Pakistan.⁴ The paradigmatic shift is required to serve the interests of students and learners rather than of policy makers and implementers by making fundamental changes in all parameters of TVET policy what to offer; who to benefit; what pedagogy and teaching and learning methods to offer and sharing of resources among stakeholders.

The present state of affairs in TVET sector of Pakistan is badly needed to be reformed as a system, keeping in view the importance and role TVET has played worldwide and can play in Pakistan with the object to give its due status of a parallel stream of education along with general education and to provide vertical progression

⁴Vision 2013, Planning Commission of Pakistan.

within the stream and mobility of its students from and into the general education. Following steps are required to reform to reorganise the TVET sector in Pakistan, Whole-of-Sector View, Policy Coherence, Fragmented Governance, Divide, Absence of Planning and Management and Stakeholder Participation in formation and management of the sector.

The responsibilities of TVET sector are divided at Federal and Provincial levels and at Federal level among different authorities and same is the state of affairs at provincial levels. The responsibilities at Federal level are split for different and often on similar elements primarily between NAVTTC and NTB though NISTE and TTBs have also few functions to perform.

The duplication, fragmentation and conflicting governance of TVET is another factor to reform TVET sector as governance determines ability of state to meet its goals and objectives set forth under different policies and laws and also ensures that quality education is being provided to all without any discrimination.

The Federal Ministry of Education and Technical Training is obligated to play more effective role to co-ordinate and facilitate the process of removing conflicts, duplication and ambiguities across all the jurisdictions of the country. The conflicts, duplications and overlapping have bearings on relationships inter se federal authorities which require urgent resolve, if the TVET sector has to be allowed to be the game changer for the country in presence of the youth bulge.

The role of TVET Advisory Council will be very critical in resolving these conflicts, ambiguities and duplication as it will help to map and clarify through consultative process respective roles of each unit and will suggest required and necessary amendments in existing laws as and when require. However, the post 18th Amendment scenario have made the role of Federal Government as of a facilitator and coordinator and for policy formulations where it will be ably assisted by TVET Advisory Councils of both Federal and Provincial Jurisdictions.

5. RECCOMENDATIONS

The TVET sector in Pakistan is in need of reforms both in organisation of TVET sector and organisational apparatus governing TVET. It is recommended that organisational apparatus of TVET sector shall be made to overcome the duplications, conflicts and overlapping of different TVET authorities at Federal and Provincial levels to enable the TVET organisation as mainstream of education to flourish and train the students as per national policies and objectives set forth to meet national and international labour market demands. The 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan shall be the guiding source to recommend such apparatus at both Federal and Provincial levels for respective mandate and interpretation by the Supreme Court of Pakistan. The recommendations are made, keeping in view the following guiding principles to achieve the organisational harmony and coherence;-

The main curse of the present TVET sector in Pakistan is existence of organisations with duplicated, overlapping and conflicting functions of these organisations which require to be removed, if TVET sector of Pakistan has to contribute in the development of Pakistan. The duplication, conflict and overlapping create confusion, ambiguity and clashes of organisation in discharge of their statutory functions,

as to which organisation is responsible for what. What is expected of an organisation rather the creation of communities of trust and partnerships, having complete understanding to resolve grey areas with mutual respect and trust.

Authorities and individuals serving in such authorities are responsible for the use of funds and other resources and for meeting operational targets, goals and to fulfill statutory obligations on the set standards for discharge of their duties. This means that the relationships between organisations and their lines of reporting must be clear and transparent and further means that the system has the capacity to take account of any breach and violations of statutory obligations and such breaches will never be tolerated.

The operational decisions are required to be made closest to where implantation takes place with a strict observance of set norms and practices.

The whole fabric of the TVET organisational apparatus shall be based upon the principle of synergy and collaboration among all federating units, as no system can flourish while having conflicts and clashes among its constituent units.

The conflict of interest among different constituent units of TVET organisation shall be avoided to make it a harmonious and coherent sector in which each unit is striving to achieve the collective objectives in support of others.

The constitutional mandate of Pakistan is required to be understood first before making any recommendation for improvement of organisational reforms in Pakistan, in which though the subject stand devolved to provinces yet the national direction is vesting in federal government.

The Constitutional mandate clearly reflects that national direction of education cannot be denied and Federal Government is under constitutional obligations to provide its due share in reformation of the organisational apparatus of the TVET sector in Pakistan and also to discharge its constitutional obligations in a way to make TVET a national priority though giving the others federating units it due to make it a coherent and uniformed TVET sector. The Supreme Court of Pakistan in Constitutional Petition No. 50 and 69 dated November 25, 2011 has interpreted that “the Federal Government cannot absolve itself from the responsibility of providing free and compulsory basic education to the people of Pakistan” in view of the addition of Article 25-A in the Constitution through the 18th Constitutional Amendment.⁵

New legislation is required at both Federal and provincial levels to bring the existing structures and laws in conformity with the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan and to clearly define the federal and provincial roles after the 18th Amendment to the Constitution having following characteristics;-

- (1) Currently NAVTTC & NTB exist as parallel organisations with almost similar functions/mandate which needs to be eliminated. NTB may be realigned and made as federal TVETA as there is no such authority for Islamabad Capital Authority having legal mandate as that of provincial TVETAs which will allow NAVTTC to serve as Apex national body as per the mandate given under NAVTTC Act 2011.
- (2) The situation warrants for the development of mechanism under which the whole TVET sector can be viewed and analysed for policy formulation

⁵PLD 2011 SC 470 (Petition no 59 & 60 of 2011).

purpose and warrants to take immediate action to Constitute a **TVET Advisory Council** under the proper legal mandate to obtain the clear picture of the sector overall and to identify all the duplications, conflicts in consultation with all stake holders particularly industry and donors. The task force be entrusted to point out all fragmented governance and to suggest ways to overcome such fragmentations. The TVET Advisory Council should be constituted with mandate to advise and recommend for coordination, policy formation, implementation and TVET delivery as per national and international market demands under Ministry of Education and Technical Training at Federal level and be made integral part of NAVTTC under the reformed mandate after completion and implementation of its recommendations in letter and spirit which will put the TVET in right direction by organising the TVET sector as per international best practices and indigenous conditions.

(3) An Independent TVET Policy

The TVET is so far being dealt under the mainstream education policies having little mention of TVET sector and the mainstream coherent education policies are even distant dreams owing to its intersections with other national policies. At first instance, the **segregation of TVET policy from the Education policy** is need of time to make TVET a priority in both government and public perspectives. The formation of TVET policy be based upon the recommendations of TVET Advisory Council and The Ministry of Education and Technical Training be obligated to coordinate and develop clarity with all other ministries and Departments and Statutory Bodies in formation of policy, so all duplications and conflicts do not surface even at the time of policy launch. Furthermore, it is also required to be made a guiding principle of every national and provincial policy that every point of intersection will be finalised with such intersecting ministries and no program will be implemented but through the main ministry.

- (4) Trade Testing Boards (TTBs) presently existing as parallel to Provincial Boards of Technical Education, be merged to make Federal Board of Technical Education & Vocational Trainings (FBTEVT) for conducting third party examination and assessment as and when proposed federal TVETAs begin to function.
- (5) Skills Development Councils SDCs shall stand abolished after repeal of NTB ordinance 1980.
- (6) National vocational qualification framework (NVQF) as launched by the NAVTTC has provided for a nationally acceptable framework on which all stake holders including provincial TVETAs have developed consensus. As such, providing for well-defined origination apparatus for its implementation and executions. However, NVQF has been launched by NAVTTC. It separately needs to be given due legislative protection by the parliament of Pakistan through an Act of the Parliament.
- (7) The functions/mandate of NAVTTC is required to be realigned to make it an Apex TVET authority at national level as per warrants of constitution of Pakistan. NAVTTC is required to be arranged and reformed at the pattern of

HEC by assigning similar tasks in the field of technical education as are provided to HEC under HEC Ordinance, 2002. The HEC is serving as the apex National body for policy making and regulation in General education, and a similar body having the national stature in TVET is need of the time to put the organisational apparatus on right track.

NAVTTTC is required to be given status in TVET as that of HEC in general education by making it a real National Apex Body, to provide direction, support and enabling environment for the promotion of technical and vocational trainings in public and private sector; (i) by promoting relevant skills; (ii) By ensuring access, equity for all citizens of Pakistan; (iii) and by exercising quality assurance by monitoring standards in technical and vocational trainings. The NAVTTTC Act is required to be amended to having functions to provide policy guidelines, direction and other ancillary matters to provide for organisation of TVET sector in Pakistan as per national and international trends and best practices. The Skill Advisory Council proposed to be created shall function as subsidiary organ of the Commission, which shall have at least 3 sittings annually to recommend new development and strategies to the Commission and submit compliance and performance of on-going policies in the country.

The Commission shall also provide career guidance and job placement centres across Pakistan in collaboration with Federal and Provincial TEVTAs. The Commission may also have monitoring role for the performance of TEVTAs, FTEVTA & FBTEVT for any federal government project and to advise the Federal and Provincial governments on proposals for grant of diplomas, certificates by vocational and technical trainings institutions and to suggest ways and means for effective coordination and linkage between vocational and technical training and industry, business and commerce to make vocational and technical training relevant and responsive to market needs including suggest innovative programmes for promotion of vocational and technical training in collaboration with Federal and Provincial TVETAs and suggest performance evaluation parameters for vocational and technical training programmes and conduct performance evaluation of TVET Institutions on recommendation of Federal and Provincial TEVTAs. The Commission may guide, facilitate and provide direction to TEVTAs, FTEVTA, BTEs and FBTEVT in implementation of national policies, and in maintenance of acceptable international standards to produce competent labour force.

- (1) The NVQF recently has been launched but without approval of the NAVTTTC Board even, and have laid down certain authorities for making TVET delivery in Pakistan competency based, those authorities are required to be given proper legal cover and needs to be provided under an amended NAVTTTC Act. The mere implementation of NVQF in letter and spirit has potential to reform the TVET sector and make it a nationally uniform and coherent system, if given proper legal protection under the Act, as is the case in whole world. The countries which have opted for NVQF worldwide have enacted and implemented it through the national level statutes to make it nationally binding and not leaving any doubt and thus eliminated any future breach by any federating units. The statutory protection of the NVQF with assigned roles of the authorities is even more required in the presence of devolution of the

subject of education to the provinces and unless there is no statutory protection of its structures and operations, the NVQF may not achieve the desired objectives for which it has been launched.

- (2) National Training Bureau (NTB) should be realigned and renamed as Federal Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (FTEVTA) having a separate legal mandate for conducting trainings within ICT or may be given mandate for Gilgit-Baltistan. The roles and functions of FTEVTA need to be clearly defined in line with the functions of other provincial TVETs working in provinces. The NTO Ordinance 1980 as amended in 2002 should be repealed and the FTEVTA Act should make it successor of NTB which will allow the employees of NTB to assume their new roles. It will avoid displacement of presently serving employees of the NTB and also to assets of TVET will remain within TVET. Furthermore, creation of FTEVTA as successor of NTB will avoid litigation from the employees of NTB. NTB was already executing body in its one of the functions so will assume primary role to maintain standards and ensure that quality trainings are imparted under the proposed arrangement.
- (3) The functions of Trade Testing Boards (TTBs) have been taken away by the provincial boards so established in each province to carry out the examinations and other ancillary matters, therefore Trade testing boards are need to be abolished being redundant and performing no functions practically and should be replaced with Federal Board of Technical Education and Vocational Training (FBTEVT) to for Federal Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority proposed to be established above on the same pattern as in provinces the provincial boards for Technical Education and vocational training are performing functions. The Federal Board of Technical Education and Vocational Trainings be assigned the similar functions as those of provincial boards.
- (4) **TVET Advisory Council** under the proper legal mandate to obtain the clear picture of the sector overall and to identify all the duplications, conflicts in consultation with all stake holders particularly industry and donors. The task force be entrusted to point out all fragmented governance and to suggest ways to overcome such fragmentations. The TVET Advisory Council should be constituted with mandate to advise and recommend for coordination, policy formation, implementation and TVET delivery as per national and international market demands under Ministry of Education and Technical Training at Federal level and be made integral part of NAVTTC under the reformed mandate after completion and implementation of its recommendations in letter and spirit which will put the TVET in right direction by organising the TVET sector as per international best practices and indigenous conditions.

Provision of TVET through Deeni Madaris to make it more equitable and ensure access of TVET to all and sundry by ensuring a coherent and unified curricula, equipment and assessment under efficient and organised structural arrangements as about 2 Million students are enrolled in such madaris.

REFERENCES

- Atta-ur-Rehman, A. R. Kemal, R. Siddiqui, Musleh-ud Din, and Z. M. Nasir (2005) Technology based Industrial Vision and Strategy for Pakistan's Socio-economic Development (Draft). Pakistan Institute of Development Economics, Higher Education Commission, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad.
- Balochistan, Government of (2011) *Act No. II Of 2011*. Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority Act 2011. TVET Department.
- Cuddy, N. and T. Leney (2005) Vocational Education and Training in the United Kingdom Thessaloniki, Greece. European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (CEDEFOP).
- Department of Education (1994) Technical Education and Skills Development Act of 1994 (with Implementing Rules and Regulations), 1995. Declaration of Policy. (Republic Act. No. 7796).
- Haider, Z. (2013) Importance of Vocational Training in Pakistan. Pakistan Get Better Soon.
- International Labour Organisation (2010a) *Qualifications Frameworks: Implementation and Impact. Background Case Study on Sri Lanka*. Geneva: International Labour Office.
- International Labour Organisation (2010b) *The Implementation and Impact of National Qualification Frameworks: Report of a Study in 16 Countries*. Geneva: International Labour Office.
- Jinnah, Q. (1947) *Speech*. Karachi: Presented at first education conference.
- KP, Government of (2015) *Act, 2015*. Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority. TVET Department.
- Pakistan, Government of (1973) *The Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973*. Islamabad: Federal Legislative Authority.
- Pakistan, Government of (2009) *National Education Policy 2009*. Islamabad: Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan.
- Pakistan, Government of (2011) National Vocational and Technical Training Commission Act. TVET Department, Act No. XV Of 2011.
- Pakistan, Government of (2011) *Pakistan's Technical and Vocational Education and Training Reform 2011*. Islamabad: Education Department.
- Pakistan, Government of (2012) National Training Broad. NTB ordinance 1980, Section 4, as amended in 2002.
- Pakistan, Government of (2014) *Pakistan Labour Force Survey*. Islamabad: Pakistan Bureau of Statistics.
- Pakistan, Government of (2014) *Profession Wise Profile of Pakistani Migrant Workers*. Islamabad: Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment.
- Pakistan, Government of (2014) *Workers' Remittances*. Karachi: State Bank of Pakistan.
- Philippines Education Department (2015) *Education for All 2015 National Review*.
- Provincial Government. (2009). Sindh Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority Act. TVET Department, Act No: VIII of 2010.
- Punjab, Government of (2010) *Act 2010*. The Punjab Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority. TVET Department.

- Sellin, B. (2002) *Scenarios and Strategies for Vocational Education and Lifelong Learning in Europe: Summary of Findings and Conclusions* European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training. CEDEFOP.
- United Nations (2013) *Total Migrant Stock at Mid-Year by Origin and Destination*. United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division.
- World Bank (2007) *Skill Development in India: The Vocational Education and Training System*. Human Development Unit.
- World Bank (2013) *Remittances*. World Bank Publications.
- Yang, G. T. (1998) *The Interaction between Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) and Economic Development in Advanced Countries*. Elsevier Science Ltd.